

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education

Board of Directors Meeting

Thursday & Friday, October 21 – 22, 2021

Virtual Meeting via Zoom

Session One: Thursday, 11:30 a.m. – 1:30 p.m. ET
Session Two: Thursday, 2:30 p.m. ET – 4:30 p.m. ET
Session Three: Thursday, 5:30 p.m. – 7 p.m. ET
Session Four: Friday, 11:30 a.m. – 1:30 p.m. ET
Session Five: Friday, 2:30 p.m. ET – 4:30 p.m. ET

MEETING MINUTES

Call to order and roll call

CNME board president Dr. Wallace called the meeting to order at 11:33 a.m. ET. The following Board members were present:

- Amanda Alexander, ND, MEd (Profession Member), Mesa, Arizona;
- Brian Andrew, JD, MA (Public Member), Chesterfield, Missouri;
- Arvin Jenab, ND (Profession Member), Costa Mesa, California;
- Joni Olehausen, ND (Profession Member), Dayton, Ohio (board vice president);
- Eileen Stretch, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona (board secretary);
- Randy Swenson, DC, MHPE (Institutional Member Rep., NUHS), Lombard, Illinois;
- Cynthia Hope, ND Bastyr U. (Institutional Member Rep., Bastyr U.), San Diego, California;
- Susan Tebb, PhD, MSW, C-IAYT, RYT-500 (Public Member), St. Louis, Missouri;
- Jamey Wallace, ND (Profession Member), Seattle, Washington (board president); and
- Melissa Woodin, CPA, MBA (Public Member), Kent, Connecticut (board treasurer)

Staff present:

- Daniel Seitz, JD, EdD (executive director), Great Barrington, Massachusetts

Guests present:

Dr. Wallace noted that guests from Bastyr U. would be joining the meeting tomorrow for the hearing on BU's focused evaluation visit and that the board would also be interviewing the two nominees for the institutional member seat from NUNM tomorrow.

Review of Board meeting agenda

There were no changes to the agenda.

Officers' and Executive Director's reports:

Secretary's report

CNME Secretary, Dr. Stretch, asked board members whether they had any corrections or additions for the minutes of the semi-annual CNME board meeting held on May 13 – 14, 2021; there were no changes or additions.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA moved, and Dr. Olehausen seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the May 13 – 14, 2021 CNME Board of Directors meeting.

The motion was unanimously approved.

President's report

CNME President, Dr. Wallace, noted that this meeting would be his last, and he thanked the board for their ongoing hard work. In particular, a number of committees met over the course of the summer and fall, and were able to accomplish a lot. He noted that the schools were continuing to be challenged by the Covid situation and that he appreciated the collaboration between AANMC/CCACO and CNME to address the need on the part of schools for flexibility in ND program delivery.

Vice President's report

CNME Vice President, Dr. Olehausen, noted that in her VP capacity, she chaired a couple of Executive Committee meetings to address the conflict-of-interest questions that had come up in regard to two CNME board members.

Treasurer's report

CNME Treasurer, Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, presented FY 2021 third quarter (i.e., 9/30/2021 budget-to-actual report). She noted that CNME was again on track to end the fiscal year with a surplus due, in part, to the CNME meeting virtually instead of in person.

Next Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, presented draft the FY 2022 budget and asked if board members had any questions.

Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To approve the draft FY 2022 budget, as presented.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Executive Director's report

CNME Executive Director, Dr. Seitz, noted that much of his work over the course of the summer and fall was working with various CNME committees, including the Strategic Planning

Committee, COSPP, Executive Committee, and the CPNME to address various topics and tasks, such as revising standards and policies. He noted that he and Michelle Manto had worked together to come up with a general plan for members' only sections of the CNME website for board members and site visitors, and noted that Michelle had done an excellent job in partnership with the CMNE webmaster to work out the specific details and to set up the sections. CNME conducted its second virtual site visit, this time a focused visit to Bastyr U. The visit went smoothly, which shows that the CNME could potentially use a hybrid site visit model in the future.

The main upcoming activities for the CNME include:

- Reaccreditation site visits to NUNM, NUHS; provide accreditation self-study workshops for school staff members.
- A follow-up in-person site visit to UAGM.
- Working with several schools, AANP and AANMC to strengthen utilization of the federal links for purposes of ongoing USDE recognition, including touching base with legal counsel on technical questions regarding federal link status.
- Continue CPNME work on residency competencies.
- Work with the Nominations Committee to interview potential CNME board candidates and to present committee recommendations to the board.
- Work with COSPP to complete the work undertaken this year on standards and policies revisions, and to develop the process for the comprehensive review of standards scheduled for 2022.

Committee and other reports; action on committee recommendations

Executive Committee

Dr. Wallace, chair of the EC, noted that the EC met few times over the last several months to: address the conflict-of-interest questions; to plan this board meeting; and to develop a new form for board members to use as part of the ED performance review process and to formally outline the steps in the performance review process and the renewal of the ED contract so that this process could be consistently handled in the future. Minutes from the Sept. EC meeting were provided with the materials for this meeting.

Dr. Wallace informed the board that the EC was recommending to the board that it authorize the EC to handle any contract renegotiations with the Executive Director following the performance review process, as outline in the Sept. 2021 EC meeting minutes.

Dr. Jenab moved, and Dr. Swenson seconded, the following motion:

To designate the Executive Committee as the entity responsible for negotiating ED employment contracts whenever authorized by the board to enter into a new contract or renew an existing contract.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Finance Committee

Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, chair of the Finance Committee, stated that the committee had met in the spring to set CNME's annual accreditation fees for FY 2022; the committee's fee recommendations were approved at the May 2021 meeting. She also noted that the CNME's financial reserves are very strong and that the CNME should continue to operate with a surplus, especially if it switches to meeting in person one time a year once holding in-person meetings are practical again.

Nominations Committee

Dr. Wallace, chair of the Nominations Committee, reported that at the end of this meeting, there will be two vacancies on the board in the profession member category: a current vacancy and a second vacancy due to Dr. Wallace finishing his second and final term as a profession member. Since the bylaws require that the CNME have 4 to 6 profession members, and we will have 4 as of the completion of this meeting, it would be good to find two new profession members over the course of the next several months. Dr. Seitz has communicated with CNME stakeholders regarding the vacancies, and has received several suggestions as to potential profession members that the Nominations Committee will need to review, including Canadian NDs. Also, Dr. Wallace reminded current CNME members to send Dr. Seitz any recommendations they might have regarding NDs who they think would be worthwhile to consider for CNME membership. Dr. Wallace stated that there are no specific skills or credentials that the CNME has identified as necessary for service on the CNME board, but generally speaking we look for NDs with other relevant experience in addition to clinical practice, whether it might be teaching, having experience with accreditation, having experience serving on non-profit boards, having participated in residency training, having participated in naturopathic professional associations, etc.

Committee on Postdoctoral Naturopathic Medical Education

Dr. Stretch, chair of the CPNME, reported that the residency competencies taskforce would resume its work after the holidays. The question was posed: When was the last time that the residency standards were comprehensively reviewed? Dr. Seitz noted that they have been revised from time to time, but they have not been comprehensively reviewed. It was suggested that just as the CNME periodically engages in a comprehensive review of its accreditation standards, it might be a good idea to similarly comprehensively review the residency standards. In early 2022, the CPNME will need to do its annual spot-checking of individual residency sites.

Committee on Standards, Policies and Procedures

Dr. Olehausen, chair of COSPP, reported that COSPP had met twice since the May CNME board meeting to consider a few recommendations from AANMC for revisions to CNME's accreditation standards and also to consider a few changes to CNME policies; these proposed revisions will be considered one by one at this meeting. Dr. Olehausen also noted that if the draft revisions to the standards are preliminarily adopted, they will need to be circulated for

public comment in accordance with CNME's policies before they are finally adopted. Dr. Olehausen stated that she appreciated AANMC's help in identifying areas where revisions might be useful.

1. *Proposed draft revision to Standard V, Section B1.1:* Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of this revision, the substance of which was recommended by AANMC, is to allow for greater flexibility for how ND programs interview applicants for admission.

Dr. Stretch moved, and Mr. Andrew, JD, MA seconded, the following motion:

To preliminarily approve the draft revision to Standard V, Section B1.1 with a small change in wording to the draft that was presented, and to circulate the draft revision for public comment.

The motion was approved, with one abstention and one opposed.

2. *Proposed draft revision to Standard VI, Section C, Paragraph 4c:* Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of this revision, the substance of which was also recommended by AANMC, is to allow for greater flexibility regarding learning activities that can count towards the clinical education requirements.

Dr. Hope moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To preliminarily approve the draft revision to Standard VI, Section C, Paragraph 4c as presented, and to circulate the draft revision for public comment.

The motion was unanimously approved.

- *Proposed draft revision to Standard VI, Section D, Paragraph 2:* Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of this revision, the substance of which was also recommended by AANMC, is to allow for the use of telemedicine as a component of the clinical training program.

Dr. Swenson moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To preliminarily approve the draft revision to Standard VI, Section D, Paragraph 2 as presented, and to circulate the draft revision for public comment.

The motion was unanimously approved.

- *Proposed draft revision to the section in the CNME Handbook of Accreditation titled "Guidelines on the Use of Information and Communication Technology in Naturopathic Medical Education":* Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of this revision was to make the guidelines consistent with draft revision to Standard VI to allow telemedicine as a component of the clinical training program.

Dr. Hope moved, and Dr. Alexander seconded, the following motion:

To approve the draft revision to the "Guidelines on the Use of Information and Communication Technology in Naturopathic Medical Education" as presented.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Swenson noted that the US Dept. of Education has revised its definition of distance education, so the CNME should make sure that its standards and polices are still consistent what the USDE may require.

- *Proposed draft revision to CNME Policy #1 (“Council Membership”)*: Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of this revision was to clarify that whenever a person who has been appointed as an institutional member representative to the Council is no longer employed by the school that nominated the board member, he/she is required to resign from the Council.

Dr. Swenson moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To approve the draft revision to the CNME Policy #1 as presented.

The motion was unanimously approved.

- *Proposed draft revisions to CNME Policy #2 (“Potential Conflicts of Interest”)*: Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of these revisions was to strengthen the board’s policies regarding identifying and addressing potential conflicts of interest, based on the board’s recent experience with a conflict-of-interest concern raised by a CNME-accredited ND program.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To approve the draft revisions to the CNME Policy #2 as presented, with the addition of a paragraph at the end of the policy to address a situation where a program may be concerned about a potential conflict of interest of a Council member.

The motion was unanimously approved.

- *Proposed draft addition to the CNME Handbook of Accreditation to clarify the timelines of the key steps towards CNME candidacy and initial accreditation, including timelines for submission of certain documents*: Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of these revisions was to clarify when ND programs may initiate the candidacy and accreditation processes.

Dr. Tebb moved, and Dr. Alexander seconded, the following motion:

To adopt the draft addition to the *CNME Handbook of Accreditation* to specify the timelines for submission of key documents related to candidacy and initial accreditation.

The motion was unanimously approved.

- *Proposed draft addition to the CNME goals to identify research and scholarship as an area where the CNME may be able to support the ongoing development of ND programs and the ND profession*: Dr. Olehausen explained that the purpose of this proposed addition is to emphasize the important role that schools can play regarding the ongoing development of naturopathic research.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To adopt the draft addition to the CNME goals statement.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Nominations Matters

Dr. Wallace informed the board that, at CNME's request, NUNM had nominated two individuals to be considered for appointment to institutional member seat that will become vacant at the conclusion of this meeting: Dr. Dee Saunders and Dr. Kelly Baltazar. The board next interviewed both candidates via video-conferencing. Following the interviews and discussion, the board voted via secret ballot on the two candidates. Dr. Dee received the majority of the votes and hence is the new institutional member rep.; her 3-year term will run until the conclusion of the 2024 annual board meeting, which will be held in the fall of 2024. Dr. Seitz will phone both candidates to inform them of the result.

Next, Dr. Wallace informed the board that Dr. Olehausen's first term as a profession member would finish as of the end of this meeting and that she is eligible for to serve a second term. Dr. Olehausen stated that she would be glad to serve another term, if the board reappoints her, and the board was given an opportunity to ask Dr. Olehausen questions. Dr. Olehausen next left the meeting and the board voted to reappoint her.

Next, Dr. Wallace informed the board that at this meeting the board needed to appoint officers, since officer elections are held every two years during odd years, at the time of the annual meeting in the fall. He also informed the board that any board member is welcome to nominate himself or herself, or to nominate a fellow board member, and that the following individuals were available to serve in the following officer positions:

- Dr. Olehausen, President
- Dr. Stretch, VP
- Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, Treasurer
- Dr. Jenab, Secretary

Since no other board members expressed interest in serving in an officer position and there no nominations from the floor, Dr. Wallace suggested that the board vote for each officer candidate in turn, with each individual under consideration leaving the meeting for a few minutes. The board voted in favor of appointing each individual listed above for the position indicated; their terms will begin at the conclusion of this meeting and will run through the 2023 annual meeting in fall 2023.

Following the appointment of officers, Dr. Olehausen noted that she would be in touch before long with board members regarding committee appointments.

(At this point, the meeting was adjourned until the following day, Friday, 10/22. The meeting resumed at 11:35 a.m. ET on Friday; all of the board members who were in attendance on 10/21 were in attendance on 10/22)

Audit Committee

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, chair of the Audit Committee, noted that the board had just received from our CPA a draft FY 2020 reviewed financial statement. Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, noted that the draft statement did not raise accounting issues and shows that the Council's financial reserves are strong. Dr. Seitz will send board members the final version once it is completed by the CPA.

Strategic Planning Committee

Dr. Wallace, chair of the Strategic Planning Committee, stated the committee had met twice since the spring 2021 meeting and that it had completed work on a draft strategic plan, and was presenting it at this meeting for review and adoption. Board members suggested a few small edits/additions, which Dr. Seitz recorded.

Dr. Olehausen moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

To adopt the draft strategic plan as presented, with the edits/additions discussed.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Additional action item: The board asked Dr. Seitz to add to the annual report form a question to elicit whether an ND program has attempted to access federal funding through any of the programs that constitute CNME's "federal links" for purposes of maintaining recognition of CNME by the US Dept. of Education.

Reports from other naturopathic organizations

Dr. Wallace stated that, at the CNME's request, AANP and CAND had both provided written updates on their activities, which he found useful and interesting to read. Dr. Seitz mentioned that the PowerPoint presentations at the organizational leaders meeting convened in September by the Naturopathic Medicine Collaborative, a copy of which he had circulated to the board, provide an update on many of the national naturopathic organizations.

New board portal on CNME website

Dr. Seitz noted that the new board-member-only portal was now operational, but that not all of the documents have been uploaded. Several board members had had a chance to try out the portal and liked how it is organized. Dr. Seitz suggested that other board members take a look at the portal sometime following this meeting and send him any suggestions they might have.

It was suggested that perhaps down the road it might be good to have a separate portal for schools.

Business related to recognition actions (closed session)

Review of Bastyr focused report and focused evaluation visit report

Four CNME board members—Drs. Wallace, Jenab, Olehausen and Hope—recused themselves

prior to this review based on the requirements of the CNME conflict-of-interest policy.

Dr. Seitz informed that board that two representatives from Bastyr U.—Dr. Byrd, President, and Dr. Connor, Dean, School of Naturopathic Medicine—would be joining the meeting in a moment to answer any questions the board might have, after which the board would deliberate on what actions, if any, it wished to take.

Next, Drs. Byrd and Connor joined the meeting and there was an opportunity for them to provide additional information to the board and for the board to ask questions. Following the hearing, Drs. Byrd and Connor left the meeting.

Dr. Swenson moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

- 1. To accept the findings of the focused evaluation visit team presented in the team report, except that Standard IV Recommendation #1 would be changed from a recommendation to an area of interest.**
- 2. To require a follow-up focused report in 12 months addressing the remaining outstanding findings.**

The motion was unanimously approved. The board members who had recused themselves for this agenda item returned to the meeting following the vote.

Review of CCNM focused report re merger

No CNME board members were required to recuse themselves.

Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, presented the focused report after which there was board discussion.

Dr. Stretch moved, and Dr. Tebb seconded, the following motion:

To require submission of a follow-up focused report in 12 months (Oct. 1, 2022 deadline) addressing the following topics:

- Total enrollment for the Fall 2022 term, as well as enrollment at each campus.**
- Update on the CCNM's finances, including submission of the FY 2021 – 2022 audited financial statement (a draft is acceptable, if a final version is not available)**
- Update on CCNM's efforts to secure a new campus in the Vancouver area and to address the high cost of the current lease arrangement.**
- Update on the curriculum revision project (note that Dr. Seitz will contact the CCNM about the apparent need to submit a substantive change regarding the curriculum revision).**

The motion was unanimously approved.

Review of ND program updates re Covid-related changes to program delivery

Dr. Seitz stated that the Board had decided previously to require all CNME-accredited ND programs to submit an update on how the programs had adapted their delivery approaches and curriculums to address the challenges presented by the limitations/mandates imposed by

states in response to the Covid situation as well as in response to institutional concerns. The following board members served as the primary reviewers for the institutions listed, and each reviewer provided to the board a summary of the reports (Dr. Seitz also reviewed the reports):

- A. Bastyr University – Dr Swenson
- B. Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine – *Dr. Olehausen*
- C. National University of Health Sciences – *Dr. Stretch*
- D. National University of Natural Medicine – *Dr. Alexander*
- E. Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine – *Dr. Hope*
- F. Universidad Ana G. Méndez – *Dr. Wallace*
- G. University of Bridgeport – Dr. Jenab

Dr. Seitz stated that while board members with a conflict of interest in regard to an institution could remain present while that institution’s report was reviewed, they should not participate in any discussion on the report.

None of the reviewers raised any issues in regard to the various adaptations/accommodations that the programs described in their reports, and all noted that the reports were responsive. It was noted, however, that the UAGM and U. Bridgeport reports could have been more detailed; apart from those two institutions, the reports were generally found to be thorough. Dr. Seitz will inform programs of the result of the review.

Dr. Wallace reiterated that the collaboration between AANMC and CNME during this challenging time has provided a valuable support to the accredited programs and their students, and that it is important to keep this two-way communication going.

It was suggested that at the May 2022 meeting, the board may want to discuss whether any further reporting from the schools is needed.

Executive Director review

Dr. Wallace thanked board members for taking the time to provide written feedback on Dr. Seitz’s performance as executive director. Dr. Seitz said a few words about his self-evaluation and expressed his appreciation for the collaborative relationship that he has with the board. Dr. Seitz then left the meeting and the board conducted its review. Following the board’s review process, Dr. Seitz returned to the meeting.

Date and site for spring 2022 meeting

Dr. Seitz stated that Dr. Olehausen and he would identify several sets of possible dates for the spring 2022 meeting, and that he would circulate them to the board to find the most convenient date.

It was generally agreed that the board should meet in person at least one time in 2022, and that right now fall 2022 would be a good time to aim for, since that would—hopefully—more likely allow for potential Covid limitations on travel to be resolved.

Recognition of departing members

On behalf of the board, Dr. Wallace recognized Dr. Swenson for his dedicated service to the Council and his thoughtful participation; all agreed that he would be missed.

Next, on behalf of the board, Dr. Olehausen thanked Dr. Wallace for his two terms of service on the board, including serving as board president and as chair of several committees. She noted her and the board's appreciation for the collegial tone that Dr. Wallace set and the how productive the Council has been under his leadership. Other board members echoed Dr. Olehausen's appreciation.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:45 p.m. ET