

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education Board of Directors Meeting

**Saturday, May 23, 2020 ♦ 11:00 a.m. – 7:00 p.m. EDT
Sunday, May 24, 2020 ♦ 11:00 a.m. – 7:00 p.m. EDT**

Virtual Meeting Via Zoom

MEETING MINUTES

Call to order and roll call

Dr. Wallace called the meeting to order at 11:05 a.m. ET. The following Board members were present:

- Brian Andrew, JD, MA (Public Member), Chesterfield, Missouri (board treasurer);
- Sarah Beasleigh, ND (Institutional Member Rep., BINM), New Westminster, British Columbia;
- Margot Gregory, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona;
- Arvin Jenab, ND (Profession Member), Costa Mesa, California;
- Joni Olehausen, ND (Profession Member), Dayton, Ohio (board vice president);
- Eileen Stretch, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona (board secretary);
- Randy Swenson, DC, MHPE (Institutional Member Rep., NUHS), Lombard, Illinois;
- Cynthia Hope, ND Bastyr U. (Institutional Member Rep., Bastyr U.), San Diego, California;
- Jamey Wallace, ND (Profession Member), Seattle, Washington (board president);
- Melissa Woodin, CPA, MBA (Public Member), Kent, Connecticut; and
- Christina Woolard, ND (Profession Member), Murfreesboro, Tennessee.

Staff present:

- Daniel Seitz, JD, EdD (executive director), Great Barrington, Massachusetts

Guests present for portions of the meeting:

- Dr. Bob Bernhardt, CCNM
- Dr. Nick De Groot, CCNM
- Elizabeth Daggett, US Dept. of Education
- Angela Chiang, US Dept. of Education

Review of Board meeting agenda and Zoom meeting protocols

The following agenda item was added to the open session for Sunday: Review of letter to the CNME from AANMC.

Dr. Wallace reviewed various aspects how to effectively use Zoom video conferencing.

Dr. Wallace noted that two representatives from the US Dept. of Education were joining the call to observe our meeting as part of the periodic review of CNME as a USDE-recognized accrediting agency. The USDE representatives both introduced themselves.

Officers' and Executive Director's reports

Secretary's report

CNME Secretary, Dr. Stretch, stated that the board needed to review and approve minutes of several meetings.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA moved, and Dr. Gregory seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the October 20, 2019 Board of Directors meeting, with typos corrected.

The motion was unanimously approved, with one abstention.

Dr. Woolard moved, and Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the April 1, 2020 Board of Directors meeting, with typos corrected.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA moved, and Dr. Jenab seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the April 15, 2020 Board of Directors meeting, with typos corrected.

The motion was unanimously approved, with one abstention.

Dr. Woolard moved, and Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the Board of Directors unanimous consent decisions dated March 21, 2020.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Treasurer's report

CNME Treasure, Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, presented the FY 2019 year-end financial report and the FY 2020 first quarter (i.e., 3/31/20) budget-to-actual report. He noted that both the year-end and first quarter reports did not contain any surprises in terms of either expenses or revenue, and also that the board meeting and travel expenses would be well under budget in FY 2020 due to conducting this meeting virtually. Board members asked questions.

Vice-President's report

CNME Vice-President, Dr. Olehausen, stated that she had nothing to report in her capacity as VP.

President's report

CNME President, Dr. Wallace, stated that the coronavirus situation was necessitating—and would likely continue to necessitate—more frequent board and committee meetings to adopt temporary policies and procedures to enable CNME to continue to conduct accreditation activities under the current unusual circumstances. He stated that he appreciates the board's willingness to go the extra mile. He'll continue to work closely with Dr. Seitz to identify issues that need to be addressed.

Executive Director's report

CNME Executive Director, Dr. Seitz, noted the following:

- ND practice and the ND higher education sector have, as we all know, have been adversely impacted by this situation, though everyone is trying their best to accommodate to changed circumstances as quickly as possible.
- The Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors (ASPA) has been holding meetings weekly to provided an opportunity for accreditors share questions and suggestions on how to deal with coronavirus-related issues affecting accreditors.

- In light of the UAGM site visit timing, it looks as if we'll need to develop policies and procedures for carrying out remote site visits or hybrid site visits (remote and onsite). We also need to revisit our current temporary policy that allows schools to make accommodations to address the coronavirus situation—in particular, handling the fall semester.
- CNME is currently in the process of applying for USDE re-recognition. This will involve an extensive review by the USDE staff of CNME's policies, procedures, and various documents to determine whether CNME is in compliance with USDE's regulations; additionally, USDE staff will observe certain aspects of our work.
- Dr. Seitz attended the NABNE/NPLEX advisory board meeting held remotely in April; they working on how to accommodate students' needs in the face of the coronavirus situation.
- Dr. Seitz attended the Naturopathic Coordinating Council (NCC) meeting in February. Among other things, the group discussed developing residency competencies (thank you, Arvin, for attending and presenting). The NCC also discussed the fact that the Google algorithm has been changed to make it harder to access information on natural medicine to address healthcare issues. As an example, the Dr. Mercola website comes up much less frequently now when people seek info on natural medicine.
- Dr. Seitz noted that on a personal note he is finishing up his last year of a 5-year term as a public member on the National Organic Standards Board, and advisory committee under the USDA. This experience has not only provided a lot of insight into the organic regulatory structure, but more generally into how federal administrative agencies work and in particular the role of a federal advisory committee such as NACIQI, which is under the USDE.

Committee reports and action on committee recommendations:

Executive Committee (EC)

EC Chair, Dr. Wallace, stated that the minutes of the March 30, 2020, EC meeting were available for review as part of the meeting materials. Dr. Wallace noted that the EC helps to plan the semi-annual and annual board meetings and addresses emergency matters that may come up.

Finance Committee

Committee chair, Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, presented the committee's proposal to keep accreditation fees unchanged for FY 2021.

Dr. Gregory moved, and Dr. Swenson seconded, the following motion:

To keep CNME's fees unchanged for FY 2021.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Nominations Committee

Committee chair, Dr. Gregory, updated the board on upcoming vacancies and appointments/reappointments, including upcoming profession member vacancies. She also noted that it will be U. of Bridgeport's turn to nominate an institutional member representative for the term starting upon completion of the fall 2020 CNME meeting.

Committee on Postdoc. Nat. Med. Education (CPNME)

Committee chair, Dr. Stretch, updated on CPNME projects and activities, including on revising and adding to the residency competencies—a project that will be undertaken by a residency competencies taskforce. She noted

that there were no recommendations for board action at this time.

Audit Committee

Committee chair, Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, reported to the board that the accounting firm used by the CNME would be conducting an audit for FY 2019.

Committee on Standards, Policies and Procedures (COSPP)

Committee chair, Dr. Olehausen, noted that the committee would be addressing a number of issues during over the next several months.

Next, Dr. Olehausen presented the minor proposed revision to Policy 14, a draft of which was provided to the board, for review by the board.

Dr. Stretch moved, and Dr. Beasleigh seconded, the following motion:

To accept the revised policy and circulate for public comment in 2020.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Strategic Planning Committee

Committee chair, Dr. Woolard, Chair, stated after the challenges presented by the coronavirus are addressed by the board, it would timely for the CNME to engage in strategic planning as the current plan is nearing its completion date.

Reports from other naturopathic organizations

Dr. Olehausen reported on her involvement with the Academic Consortium for Integrative Health.

Other business

There was no other open session business.

Business related to recognition actions

[The board entered into closed session to address recognition actions and other closed-session business.]

Hearing on reaccreditation of CCNM's ND program

Dr. Wallace asked that any board members with a conflict of interest, as defined by the CNME policy, to leave the Zoom call during the hearing on CCNM. No one had a conflict.

The representatives from CCNM—Drs. Bernhardt and De Groot—were invited to join the call, and introductions were made. Next Dr. Olehausen summarized the team report and the school representatives were invited to make comments to the board. The board was next given an opportunity to ask questions of the school representatives, after which they left the call.

Dr. Swenson moved, and Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, seconded, the following motion:

To adopt the findings (i.e., commendations, recommendations, and areas of interest in the team report without any changes, and to reaccredit the CCNM ND program for a period of seven years.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Review plans for UAGM site visit for initial accreditation of the ND program

Dr. Seitz stated that the UAGM site visit had been postponed to August due to the coronavirus situation. All agreed that given the uncertainty of travel during the next several months, it would be advisable to develop a temporary policy allowing for remote site visits. COSPP and the CNME board will be convened, as needed, to work on this.

Review of 2019 Annual Reports of ND Programs, including review of reports from programs regarding coronavirus-related accommodations/changes in accordance with CNME temporary emergency policies

Dr. Seitz reminded the Board of CNME's process for reviewing annual reports:

- A review team of two board members is responsible for (i) reviewing each ND program's annual report for completeness and responsiveness, (ii) making a recommendation regarding whether the program in question has satisfactorily addressed outstanding recommendations and areas of interest, and (iii) if applicable, recommendation other board action. Dr. Seitz noted that he also reviews annual reports and is available to assist teams.
- This year, as required by CNME, accredited/candidate ND programs have also submitted a report on any temporary accommodations/changes to their curriculum and/or program delivery they've made to address the challenges presented by the coronavirus situation. Review teams were asked to make sure that any temporary measures were in accordance with the temporary coronavirus policies adopted previously by the CNME board.
- As with accreditation hearing, any board members with a conflict of interest are required to recuse themselves from the discussion on the annual report and any board vote. (Dr. Wallace reminded board members of the process for hanging out in the Zoom waiting room when recused.)

University of Bridgeport

Dr. Gregory stated that she had a conflict of interest and recused herself from review of UB's annual report.

Dr. Jenab, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME's temporary policies. Additionally, Dr. Arvin stated that the team recommends to the board the following action:

- To maintain in effect Recommendation VI-1.
- To remove the following recommendations: Rec. I-1, Rec. VII-1, and Rec. VIII-1

Dr. Stretch moved, and Dr. Jenab, seconded, the following motion:

To accept the recommendations of the UB annual report review team.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Gregory rejoined the meeting.

National University of Natural Medicine

No board members had a conflict of interest.

Dr. Jamey Wallace, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME's temporary policies. Since there are no outstanding findings related to NUNM, no board action is required.

National University of Health Sciences

Dr. Swenson stated that he had a conflict of interest and recused himself from review of NUHS's annual report.

Dr. Stretch, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME's temporary policies. Additionally, Dr. Stretch stated that the team recommends to the board that it maintain in effect the following two areas of interest: Area of Interest VII-2 and Area of Interest. Dr Seitz reminded the board that an area of interest is not considered a finding of non-compliance or insufficient compliance with CNME accreditation standards; rather, it's a weakness that should be addressed.

Dr. Olehausen moved, and Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, seconded, the following motion:

To accept the recommendations of the NUHS annual report review team.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Swenson rejoined the meeting.

Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine

No board members had a conflict of interest.

Dr. Margot Gregory, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME's temporary policies. Since the CNME at this meeting just voted to reaccredit their ND program, here are no outstanding findings related to CCNM that require board action.

Boucher Institute of Naturopathic Medicine (including a focused report)

Drs. Beasleigh and Jenab stated that they had a conflict of interest and recused themselves from the review of BINM's annual and focused report.

Dr. Christina Woolard, chair of the review team, stated that the team found both the annual report and focused report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME's temporary policies. Dr. Woolard stated that the team recommends to the board the following action in regard to the outstanding findings:

- To maintain in effect the following recommendations: Rec. III-1 and Rec. IV-1.
- To change Area of Interest III-1 to a recommendation (listed as Recommendation III-2).
- To remove Recommendation IV-2.

Additionally, due to BINM's current lack of financial stability in its financial operations, Dr. Woolard stated that the team recommends to the board the following action based on its review of the annual report and focused report:

- To issue a Letter of Advisement effective May 24, 2020.
- To require submission of a focused report by October 15, 2020, on BINM's financial condition that includes the following:

- Final or preliminary draft FY 2020 accountant-reviewed year-end financial statement.
- FY 2021 institutional budget including the assumptions on which the budget is based and detailed information demonstrating that the assumptions are realistic.
- Information on enrollment numbers for the 2020 – 2021 academic year.
- Detailed information and documentation on institutional plans to address the institution’s financial instability and/or related specific actions that are currently in progress or that have been completed to strengthen financial stability.
- To conduct a focused evaluation visit to the BINM campus at a mutually convenient time during the time period October 2020 – February 2021, with the specific dates to be determined; the purpose of the visit is to assess the institution’s progress in addressing the outstanding findings.

Dr. Stretch moved, and Dr. Hope, seconded, the following motion:

To accept the recommendations of the BINM annual report review team.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Drs. Beasleigh and Jenab rejoined the meeting.

Universidad Ana G. Méndez

No board members had a conflict of interest.

Dr. Joni Olehausen, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME’s temporary policies. Additionally, Dr. Olehausen stated that the team recommends to the board the following:

- To change Recommendation VI-1 to Area of Interest VI-1.
- To maintain in effect Recommendation VII-1.
- To eliminate Recommendation VI-3.
- To eliminate Area of Interest III-1.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, moved, and Dr. Woolard, seconded, the following motion:

To accept the recommendations of the UAGM annual report review team.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine

Dr. Gregory stated that he had a conflict of interest and recused himself from review of SCNM’s annual report.

Dr. Sarah Beasleigh, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME’s temporary policies. Additionally, Dr. Beasleigh stated that the team recommends to the board the following.

- To eliminate Recommendation VI-1.
- To require continued reporting on Area of Interest II-1 and Area of Interest VI-1.
- To eliminate Residency Recommendation I and Residency Recommendation II.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, moved, and Dr. Woolard, seconded, the following motion:

To accept the recommendations of the SCNM annual report review team.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Bastyr University, Naturopathic Medicine Program

The following board members recused themselves due to a conflict of interest: Drs. Olehausen, Wallace, Jenab and Hope.

Dr. Randy Swenson, chair of the review team, stated that the team found the report to be complete and responsive, and that the coronavirus report complied with CNME's temporary policies. Additionally, Dr. Swenson stated that Bastyr's ND program was last reaccredited in October of 2019 and therefore Bastyr had only had several months so far to address outstanding findings; therefore, the review team recommends that all of the outstanding recommendations and areas of interest continue to be reported on.

Dr. Gregory, moved, and Dr. Beasleigh, seconded, the following motion:

To accept the recommendations of the Bastyr U. annual report review team.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Report on Financial Statements

Ms. Woodin, CPA, MBA, report that she and Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, had reviewed the financial statements submitted by accredited and candidate ND programs, and that the reviewers had nothing to add beyond their feedback given during the review of each of the ND annual reports: namely, that while the schools are experiencing financial challenges, they are all still reasonably financially stable with the exception of BINM, which has a substantial financial reserve but is not currently operating in way that is financially sustainable in the long run.

AANMC letter to the CNME Board

The board agreed that over the next several months the COSPP and full board, as appropriate, should address the issues raised in the letter.

Emergency ED succession

The board discussed the (hopefully unlikely) emergency situation where the board would need to appoint someone to serve as a temporary executive director (ED).

Dr. Swenson, moved, and Dr. Hope, seconded, the following motion:

To designate the VP as the person to temporarily assume the ED role should an emergency situation so require.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Seitz will provide an orientation to CNME VP, Dr. Olehausen, and let her know how to access CNME documents.

Date and site of the fall 2020 Council meeting

Dr. Seitz stated that three sets of dates were under consideration for the fall meeting and that the date will be finalized soon based on board member availability.

Recognition of departing members

Dr. Wallace recognized and thanked Dr. Woolard for her six years of dedicated service to CNME as the board president and in other roles.

Adjournment

Dr. Gregory, moved, and Dr. Stretch, seconded, the following motion:

To adjourn the meeting.

The motion was unanimously approved.