

**Council on Naturopathic Medical Education
Board of Directors Meeting**

Saturday, May 18, 2019 ♦ 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.

Sunday, May 19, 2019 ♦ 8:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.

Hotel Valley Ho ♦ Dunes Room ♦ Scottsdale, Arizona

Meeting Minutes

Call to order and roll call

Dr. Woolard called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. The following Board members were present:

- Brian Andrew, JD, MA (Public Member), Chesterfield, Missouri;
- Sarah Beasleigh, ND (Institutional Member Rep., BINM), New Westminster, British Columbia (via conference call);
- Margot Gregory, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona (board vice president);
- Arvin Jenab, ND (Profession Member), Costa Mesa, California;
- Joni Olehausen, ND (Profession Member), Dayton, Ohio
- John Pecchia, CPA (Public Member), Poughkeepsie, New York (board treasurer);
- Eileen Stretch, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona;
- Randy Swenson, DC, MHPE (Institutional Member Rep., NUHS), Lombard, Illinois
- H. Garrett Thompson, DC, PhD (Institutional Member Rep., SCNM), Tempe, Arizona (board secretary);
- Jamey Wallace, ND (Profession Member), Seattle, Washington; and
- Christina Woolard, ND (Profession Member), Murfreesboro, Tennessee (board president)

Staff present:

- Daniel Seitz, JD, EdD (executive director), Great Barrington, Massachusetts

Review of Board meeting agenda

Some of the agenda items were rearranged.

Officers' and Executive Director's reports

Secretary's Report

Council secretary, Dr. Thompson, asked the board to review and approve the minutes from the last Council meeting.

Dr. Gregory moved, and Dr. Wallace seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the October 13 – 14, 2018 Board of Directors meeting, with typos corrected.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Treasurer's Report

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, the Council's Treasurer presented the FY 2018 year-end financial report, noting that the

Council ended the year with a surplus of \$14,438; revenues and expenditures tracked the budget fairly closely. Mr. Pecchia, CPA, also reviewed the 3/31/19 budget-to-actual report. So far, there have been no surprises.

Vice President's Report

Dr. Gregory, Council VP, stated that she had nothing to report.

President's Report

Dr. Woolard, Council President, noted the following:

- U. Bridgeport's decision to phase out the ND program is a big blow to the profession, especially on the East Coast; this circumstance underlines the importance of the naturopathic community working together to strengthen naturopathic profession in the U.S. and Canada and gaining greater recognition via licensure, etc., since its relatively small size in relation to more established medical professions makes it vulnerable, as well as the fact that salaries are also relatively modest.
- She attended the NABNE advisory board meeting on behalf of the CNME, since Dr. Seitz was tied up with a meeting of the National Organic Standards Board. NABNE expressed a commitment to be more transparent about their process. The competing licensing exam that is being developed under the auspices of the Ontario ND regulatory authority is scheduled to be administered for the first time in June 2019. There is concern in both Canada and the U.S. that this will split the profession to some degree, and also increase costs to NDs who may be interested in licensure in more than one jurisdiction.
- Universidad del Turabo officially changed its name to Universidad Ana G. Méndez
- She has finalized committee assignments for this year.

Executive Director's Report

Dr. Seitz, Council Executive Director, noted the following:

- The US Dept. of Education (USDE) is considering revisions to the regulations for recognizing accrediting agencies. It's too soon to predict what the final revisions will look like.
- The CNME is up for USDE re-recognition in 2021, and will be starting the re-recognition application process in 2020—so it's important for us to keep abreast of USDE regulatory changes. There have already been some minor changes in the regulations that will necessitate minor revisions to CNME policies; Dr. Seitz will present revised policies to the board for review over the next couple of meetings. USDE staff will need to observe various CNME activities, such as a board meeting and a site visit; Dr. Seitz has been in touch with USDE to try to find out which of their staff reviewers will be handling the CNME re-recognition review process; he has not yet heard back.
- In June, the CNME will conduct a reaccreditation site visit for the Bastyr ND program; this will be a week-long visit to accommodate both the WA and CA campuses.
- Site visits are scheduled in 2020 for CCNM (reaccreditation of the ND program) and Universidad Ana G. Méndez (initial accreditation of the ND program).

Committee reports and action on committee recommendations

Executive Committee

Dr. Woolard, EC Chair, reported that the committee met in April; the minutes of that meeting are included with the materials for this meeting. Among other things, the EC met to plan the spring board meeting, discuss providing a COLA adjustment to the ED's salary, consider options for emergency succession in the event that the

ED is incapacitated or dies, discuss options for an increase in fees to the schools to compensate for U. of Bridgeport's discontinuance of its ND program once current students are taught out, and to move reserve funds to higher interest bearing accounts.

The board discussed the idea of appointing someone to be trained to serve in an emergency capacity should the ED be incapacitated or die, and agreed that Dr. Gregory, as the board VP, would for the time being serve as the designated interim ED in the event of an emergency. Dr. Seitz will provide some training to Dr. Longenecker, and will work on developing an operations manual that would help an interim ED handle the role; he will also draft an interim ED policy for presentation to the board.

Finance Committee

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, Chair of the Finance Committee, presented options for increasing the annual accreditation fees charged to the schools to compensate for U. Bridgeport's discontinuance of its ND program once current students are taught out. It was noted that fortunately CNME has some time to address this issue, since its reserves are at a healthy level and UB will continue to pay the annual fee over the next three years while it teaches out its current students. The idea of holding one in-person meeting per year was discussed; for now, the board agreed that it was important to continue meeting twice a year, but it will revisit this idea in the future.

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, moved, and Mr. Andrew, JD, seconded, the following motion:

For FY 2020, to increase base fee amount by 2% and the FTE fee amount by \$1 over the fees charged in 2019.

The motion was approved with 10 affirmative votes and one abstention.

The board asked Dr. Seitz to convey to the schools information on the fee increase for 2020, and also that this fee increase is the first increase in five years and that the Council anticipates implementing gradual, modest fee increases over the next several years similar to the 2020 increase to compensate for the loss of revenue due to the University of Bridgeport's decision to discontinue its ND program. Additionally, the Council will continue to monitor the level of fees that are necessary to operate so as to keep fee increases to a minimum.

Membership and Nominations Committee

Dr. Gregory, Chair of the Nominations Committee, updated the board on committee activities, upcoming vacancies, and appointments/reappointments:

- The committee is recommending that the board consider appointing Melissa Woodin, CPA, to a public member seat.
- Mr. Andrew, JD, is up for reappointment as a public member; he is interested in and willing to serve a second term.
- Dr. Seitz mentioned he has identified a third potential public member: Susan Tebb, PhD, who has extensive accreditation experience as a board member on the Council on Social Work Education and as a site visitor on accreditation site teams.

Committee on Postdoctoral Naturopathic Medical Education

Dr. Stretch, CPNME Chair, informed the board that there were no issues requiring a board decision. She updated the board of some of the topics that the CPNME had discussed at its meeting, including: the potential legal issues and challenges associated with offering residencies located in unlicensed states; the potential need in the future to create a separate organization to oversee residencies; problems with start-up residencies that do not have sufficient financial resources to fully support a residency; the interest and possible cost associated with

developing residency competencies; employment issues that come up due to insufficiently clear employment contracts; and so on. The CPNME will address some of these issues through revisions to the Residency Handbook.

Audit Committee

Mr. Andrews, JD, Chair of the Audit Committee, informed the board that for FY 2018, a financial review will be performed, and for FY 2019 there will be an audit. Dr. Seitz will get bids from two or three CPA firms for conducting the audit, since we've been using the same firm for many years. The question was raised whether the District of Columbia, where CNME is incorporated as a nonprofit organization, has any laws that specify whether and how often a financial audit must be performed and, if so, whether there is any revenue threshold that triggers an audit requirement. Dr. Seitz will review the DC laws.

Committee on Standards, Policies and Procedures

Dr. Thompson, Chair of COSPP, informed the board that currently the committee is not considering revisions to any CNME standards, policies or procedures. He noted that there are some emerging technologies in medicine, such as telemedicine, that might impact ND education, and for that reason the CNME may need to consider potential impacts in light of our standards and policies.

AANMC is looking into developing competencies in regard to patient encounters via telemedicine, and is also interested in defining the role of advanced preceptorships in the context of ND education. AANMC may recommend changes to CNME's standards to address these areas; Dr. Thompson will monitor AANMC's work and bring any issues to CNME/COSPP that may require the Council's attention.

Dr. Seitz noted that there may be some changes in the US Dept. of Education recognition regulations that may necessitate policy revisions on the part of CNME.

Strategic Planning Committee

Dr. Woolard, Chair of the Strategic Planning Committee, stated that the SPC is not currently engaged in any planning activities, and that there may be some ideas that come out this meeting that the committee may wish to look into as part of the ongoing strategic planning process.

Reports from other naturopathic organizations

As she had mentioned earlier in the meeting, Dr Woolard attended the annual NABNE advisory board meeting on behalf of CNME. NABNE has expressed a commitment to be more transparent about their process. She reported that the competing licensing exam that is being developed under the auspices of the Ontario ND regulatory authority is scheduled to be administered for the first time in June 2019. There is concern in both Canada and the U.S. that this will split the profession to some degree, and also increase costs to NDs who may be interested in licensure in more than one jurisdiction.

Other business

Dr. Seitz stated that that it would be useful to do another evaluator training workshop, perhaps at the fall 2019 CNME meeting. As in the past, the CNME would ask the schools to sponsor—and pay the attendance expenses—of one or two participants. The board expressed support for a fall workshop and asking the schools to sponsor participants. It was suggested that in communications with the schools it would be good to emphasize the

usefulness to the schools of sending participants, since that will help build institutional understanding of the CNME accreditation process.

Business related to recognition actions

The Board entered into a closed session to consider recognition actions and other individual ND program-related business, including the review of annual reports. Dr. Seitz reminded board members of the CNME's conflict of interest policy and the requirement for members with a conflict of interest to recuse themselves from board deliberations regarding actions, except when a board member is representing his/her institution at a hearing—in which case the person is not acting as a board member.

Hearing on Reaccreditation of SCNM's ND program

Prior to the start of the hearing, Drs. Olehausen and Gregory recused themselves due to a conflict of interest based on having previously worked at SCNM in the last seven years. Dr. Thompson informed the board that he would recuse himself as a current SCNM employee, but be present for the hearing as a representative of SCNM.

The board had a preliminary discussion on this agenda item, and then invited the Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences (SCNM) representatives into the meeting room. The SCNM representatives in attendance were:

- Paul Mittman, ND, EdD, SCNM President;
- H. Garrett Thompson, DC, PhD, Vice President of Academic Affairs; and
- Jessica Mitchell, ND, Associate Dean.

After introductions, the SCNM representatives were invited to address any of the findings from the evaluation visit and any other matters of interest. Next, Council members asked representatives questions regarding the team's findings as well as general questions about SCNM. Upon completion of the Q & A portion of the hearing, the SCNM representatives left the meeting room, and the Council reviewed and discussed the evaluation team recommendations, SCNM's formal response, and new information presented. Based on their review, the Council made a decision regarding reaccreditation of the SCNM ND program.

Dr. Wallace moved, and Mr. Andrew, JD seconded, the following motion:

- **To reaccredit SCNM's ND program for a period of seven years, effective May 19, 2019; and**
- **To revise and adopt the evaluation team's findings (see attached addendum to the minutes for the list of findings adopted by the board).**

The motion was unanimously approved.

Review of BINM's focused report

Prior to consideration of this agenda item, Dr. Jenab recused himself due to a conflict of interest based on having worked at BINM in the last seven years. Dr. Beasleigh informed the board that he would recuse herself as a current SCNM employee, but be present for the hearing as a representative of BINM.

The board had a preliminary discussion on this agenda item, and then invited representatives from Boucher into the meeting room. The BINM representatives in attendance were:

- Michael Schanz, MBA, President; and
- Sarah Beasleigh, ND, Provost.

Mr. Schanz summarized the actions the institution is taking to address its financial challenges and board members asked questions. Mr. Schanz and Dr. Beasleigh then left the meeting room.

Mr. Andrew, JD, moved, and Dr. Thompson, seconded, the following motion:

- **To postpone, for the time being, conducting a focused visit to the institution in order to give the institution more time to implement plans to strengthen its financial situation.**
- **To require submission of a focused report four weeks prior to the fall 2019 CNME meeting that addresses:**
 - **The institution's financial situation;**
 - **The status of the institution's efforts to sell its current facility; and**
 - **The status of the institution's efforts to affiliate or merge with another higher education institution.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Seitz noted that at its fall 2019 meeting the board will need to make the final decision on reaccreditation of BINM's ND program, since it previously deferred a decision in order to give the institution an opportunity to satisfactorily address its financial weaknesses.

Review of UB's teach-out plan

There were no recusals due to a conflict of interest.

The board had a preliminary discussion on this agenda item, and then invited Dr. Marcia Prenguber, Director of the University of Bridgeport School of Naturopathic Medicine (UBSNM) into the meeting room. After the board discussed with Dr. Prenguber U. Bridgeport's decision to discontinue the ND program and UBSNM's plan to teach out the current students, Dr. Prenguber left the meeting room.

Dr. Wallace moved, and Dr. Jenab, seconded, the following motion:

- **To accept UBSNM's teach-out plan, and to request that an update on the implementation of the teach-out plan be provided with the school's annual report while the school still remains in operation.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

Review of 2018 Annual Reports of ND Programs

Prior to the review of individual annual reports, Dr. Seitz reminded board members of the report review process, and how to address board member conflicts of interest (COIs). Regarding COIs, the following is the Council's process:

- Individuals who have a past involvement with an institution that falls under the COI policy may remain in the meeting room, but should neither participate in discussion nor vote on any decision.
- Individuals who are currently employed by—or have some other current involvement with—an institution must leave the meeting room for the entire review process.

UBSNM

Dr. Wallace, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive, and presented team's recommendations regarding removal of any recommendations and areas of interest.

Dr. Wallace moved, and Dr. Gregory, seconded, the following motion:

- **To maintain in effect the following recommendations: Rec. I-1, Rec. VI-1, Rec. VII-1, Rec. VIII-1**
- **To remove the following recommendations: Rec. II-1 and Rec. V-I.**
- **To remove all areas of interest, namely with the exception of Areas of Interest II-1, VI-1 and VII-1.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

NUNM

Dr. Woolard, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive, and informed the board that the university had recently appointed a new president: Christine Gerard, ND, who formerly served as dean at SCNM and on the CNME board. She stated that there were no outstanding recommendations, and that the team was recommending removal of the one remaining area of interest.

Dr. Woolard moved, and Dr. Stretch, seconded, the following motion:

- **To remove Area of Interest III-1.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

NUHS

Dr. Swenson left the meeting room due to being currently employed by NUHS.

Dr. Gregory, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive, except that the school needs to provide better documentation that it has addressed a couple of outstanding areas of interest, since the documentation provided was inadequate to make a decision on removal. She noted that there had recently been a poor exam result on the NPLEX 1 exam, but this is not indicative of a trend. The university continues to be very strong financially. Dr. Gregory presented the team's recommendations to the board on which findings to keep and remove.

Mr. Andrew, JD, moved, and Dr. Woolard, seconded, the following motion:

- **To remove Recommendation VI-1.**
- **To remove the Area of interests IV-1, IV-5 and VII-1.**
- **To maintain in effect Areas of Interest VII-2 and X-1.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

CCNM

Dr. Thompson, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive, but that its financial situation is still weak. Mr. Pecchia, CPA, provided information on the financial ratios and what they indicate. Based on the current financial situation, the board discussed its options regarding findings and reporting.

Dr. Thompson moved, and Mr. Andrew, seconded, the following motion:

- **To change the outstanding recommendation (III.1) to read as follows:**
Recommendation III-1: While the program/institution has taken fruitful steps to improve its financial performance, the institution is still very weak financially as demonstrated by its financial ratios and lack of liquidity. The program must continue to strengthen its finances and must develop a detailed, realistic 5-year plan. (Std. III.A.2; Std.III.B.1)
- **To require CCNM to provide a detailed, realistic 5-year plan to improve financial stability to be**

submitted to the CNME 4 weeks prior to the fall 2019 meeting, which is scheduled for October 19 – 20, 2019.

The motion was unanimously approved.

BINM

Dr. Beasleigh left the meeting room due to being currently employed by BINM.

Dr. Olehausen, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive, but that its financial situation is still weak as Mr. Pecchia, CPA, noted during the review of the institution's focused report. She presented the team's recommendations to the board on which findings to keep and remove.

Dr. Wallace moved, and Dr. Thompson, seconded, the following motion:

- **To maintain in effect the following recommendations: Rec. III-1, Rec. IV-1, and Rec. IV-2.**
- **To maintain in effect Area of Interest III-1.**
- **To remove the remaining Areas of Interest, namely: Area of interest II-1, Area of Interest IV-1, Area of Interest IV-2, Area of Interest VII-1 and Area of Interest X-1.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

Universidad Ana G. Mendéz

Dr. Beasleigh, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive, and presented team's recommendations regarding removal of any recommendations and areas of interest.

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, moved, and Dr. Woolard, seconded, the following motion:

- **To maintain in effect the following recommendations: Rec. VI-1, Rec. VI-3, and Rec. VII-1.**
- **To maintain in effect Area of Interest III-1.**
- **To remove the following Areas of Interest: Area of interest VI-1, Area of Interest VI-4 and Area of Interest VI-5.**

The motion was unanimously approved.

SCNM

Dr. Thompson left the meeting room due to being currently employed by SCNM.

Dr. Jenab, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive. He noted that all of findings from the reaccreditation visit prior to this year's visit have been satisfactorily addressed. There have been some senior staff hires, an increase in NPLEX scores, and a number of areas of growth.

Bastyr University

Dr. Wallace left the meeting room due to being currently employed by Bastyr University.

Dr. Swenson, the lead reviewer, stated that the review team found the annual report to be complete and responsive. He noted that all of findings from the previous reaccreditation visit have been satisfactorily

addressed. BU has suffered a decrease in ND enrollment, which has impacted its income; however, the institution's financial situation is still reasonably strong, and they have developed a detailed plan to address the loss of income.

Report on Review of Financial Statements

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, and Mr. Andrew, JD, reviewed the financial statements submitted along with the institutions' annual reports. Mr. Pecchia stated that a few institutions, as already discussed during the annual report reviews, are facing some financial challenges, and that the downturn in ND enrollment is an issue that institutions need to carefully plan around in order to lessen the negative impact. The sophistication of financial management is also an issue for a couple of institutions.

Nominations matters

Dr. Gregory, chair of the nominations committee, stated that she and Dr. Seitz would arrange a conference call so that the board can interview Melissa Woodin, CPA, for appointment as a public member. She also informed the board that Mr. Andrew's first term as a public member was ending and that he is eligible for reappointment. Mr. Andrew indicated that he would be willing and interested in serving another term, and would be honored if the board reappointed him; he then left the meeting room.

Dr. Jenab moved, and Dr. Thompson, seconded, the following motion:

To reappoint Mr. Andrew, JD, to serve a second term on the CNME board as a public member.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Miscellaneous business (open session resumed)

Dr. Seitz informed the board that the fall 2019 Council meeting would be held on October 19 – 20, 2019; the location has not yet been selected.

Dr. Woolard adjourned the meeting at 5:40 p.m.