

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education

Board of Directors Meeting

Sunday, October 20, 2019 ♦ 8:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.

Mayflower Park Hotel ♦ Seattle, Washington ♦ Green Room

MEETING MINUTES

Call to order and roll call

Dr. Woolard called the meeting to order at 8:35 p.m. The following Board members were present:

- Brian Andrew, JD, MA (Public Member), Chesterfield, Missouri;
- Sarah Beasleigh, ND (Institutional Member Rep., BINM), New Westminster, British Columbia (via conference call);
- Margot Gregory, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona (board vice president);
- Arvin Jenab, ND (Profession Member), Costa Mesa, California;
- Joni Olehausen, ND (Profession Member), Dayton, Ohio;
- John Pecchia, CPA (Public Member), Poughkeepsie, New York (board treasurer);
- Eileen Stretch, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona;
- Randy Swenson, DC, MHPE (Institutional Member Rep., NUHS), Lombard, Illinois;
- H. Garrett Thompson, DC, PhD (Institutional Member Rep., SCNM), Tempe, Arizona (board secretary);
- Jamey Wallace, ND (Profession Member), Seattle, Washington;
- Melissa Woodin, CPA, MBA (Public Member), Kent, Connecticut; and
- Christina Woolard, ND (Profession Member), Murfreesboro, Tennessee (board president).

Staff present:

- Daniel Seitz, JD, EdD (executive director), Great Barrington, Massachusetts

Guests present:

- Dr. Cynthia Hope, Bastyr U.
- Dr. Greg Cramer, NUHS
- Dr. Arianna Staruch, Bastyr U.
- Dr. David Rule, Bastyr U.
- Mr. Harlan Patterson, Bastyr U.

Review of Board meeting agenda

The following agenda item was added to the closed session: Interview of Dr. Hope for an institutional member representative seat.

Officers' and Executive Director's reports

Secretary's Report

Council secretary, Dr. Thompson, asked the board to review and approve the minutes from the last Council meeting.

Dr. Gregory moved, and Mr. Andrew seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the May 18 – 19, 2019 Board of Directors meeting, with typos corrected.

The motion was unanimously approved, with one abstention.

President's Report

Dr. Woolard stated that she felt that the previous day's evaluator training went well, and informed the board that SCNM had recently initiated some new master's degree programs and so was now a multipurpose institution. Following this meeting, committee assignments will need to be reviewed.

Vice President's Report

Dr. Gregory reported that she had nothing to report.

Treasurer's Report

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, review of 09-30-19 actual vs. budget report and noted that revenues and expenditures were tracking fairly close to budget and that there were no surprises.

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, presented the draft FY 2020 budget, and noted that the equipment line should be reduced from \$3,000 to something around \$1,500, since Dr. Seitz recently bought a computer to replace the old one, and thus any equipment expenses will be more modest. He also noted that some other lines would be good to revise somewhat once the FY 2019 year-end numbers are available. Dr. Seitz will make these adjustments.

Executive Director's Report

Dr. Seitz reported the following:

- He attended the meeting of the Canadian Naturopathic Coordinating Council in September. Efforts continue to achieve ND licensure/regulation in new provinces and territories. Ontario is moving forward with implementing its own licensing exam.
- This coming year there are two evaluation visits coming up—an initial accreditation visit to Universidad Ana G. Méndez (formerly Universidad del Turabo), and Canadian College of Naturopathic Medicine for reaccreditation of their ND program.
- CNME will be up for re-recognition by the US Dept. of Education; he contacted them to find out when the application will be due but has not heard anything.

Committee reports and action on committee recommendations:

Executive Committee

Dr. Woolard, chair, reported that the committee had met to review the agenda and otherwise prepare

for this meeting.

Finance Committee

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, chair noted that the committee had not dealt with any business. Next spring it will need to consider another modest fee increase.

Nominations Committee updates

Dr. Gregory, chair, noted the following:

- During the closed session later in the meeting, the board will interview Dr. Hope, who was nominated by Bastyr University for the institutional member representative seat.
- This is the last meeting for Dr. Thompson, who has served as an institutional member representative, and Mr. Pecchia, CPA, who has served two terms as a public member.
- At this meeting, the board will need to vote on officer positions; this takes place during the fall meeting in odd years.

Committee on Postdoctoral Naturopathic Medical Education

Dr. Stretch, chair, reported the following:

- The CPNME will be meeting before the end of the year to revise the employment guidelines document, and will address—among other things—the recommended minimum salary and benefits.
- The CPNME agreed that residents should always enter into an employment contract before starting the residency; currently, a large proportion of resident complaints are due to misunderstandings and/or unclarity around the employment terms. This requirement will be in the next edition of the Residency Handbook, which will be issued in 2020.
- The CPNME reviewed the challenges of offering CNME-approved residencies in unlicensed states/province: the legality of practice in such jurisdictions is in somewhat gray zone and there is no scope of practice defined by regulation. While the CPNME decided that this should be allowed, residents entering into residencies in unlicensed jurisdictions need to be apprised of the inherent challenges. A paragraph regarding this will be added to the 2020 edition of the handbook.
- Later this year the CPNME will resume spot-checking the residency site database to ensure that the recognized residency sponsors (i.e., the schools) are keeping materials and information up-to-date.

Committee on Standards, Policies and Procedures

Dr. Thompson reported that there had been no need for the committee to meet. Dr. Seitz stated that the US Dept. of Education would be issuing revised regulations regarding recognized accreditors, and that the CNME may need to consider revisions to its standards, policies and procedures as a result.

Audit Committee

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, chair, stated that we will be requesting proposals from a couple CPAs for the FY 2019 audit.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, noted that the FY 2018 reviewed financial statements, which were provided for this meeting, did not have any surprises and the CNME has healthy financial reserves.

Strategic Planning Committee

Dr. Woolard, chair, stated that the committee had not met since the last meeting, and that before long it would be good to convene the committee to consider whether there are issues/challenges on the horizon that we need to plan for.

Reports from other naturopathic organizations

CCACO

Dr. Thompson, who is a member of the Council of Chief Academic and Clinical Officers (CCACO), which is a committee under the Association of Accredited Naturopathic Medical Colleges (AANMC), is looking into the question of return on investment (ROI) for graduates: How do we make programs more attractive to potential students, who might be concerned that the time and cost associated with ND education may not be worth it given current employment opportunities. The following are some of topics related to ROI that CCACO is looking at:

- Required pre-requisite's: Are the usual one all necessary for successful completion of an ND program;
- The total length of program;
- The model of clinical training we use; and
- More effective integration of online/blended learning approaches.

All agreed that the CNME should be open to considering any proposal from CCACO/AANMC regarding changes to its standards and policies that might improve the affordability of an ND education without compromising the quality. Changes in the higher education marketplace necessitate the creative engagement of every aspect of the profession, most notably the schools and CNME. CNME would welcome the opportunity to enter into discussion with CCACO: formal invitation.

Other open-session business

Review draft emergency interim ED appointment policy

The board agreed that, overall, the policy looks good, but it would be helpful to make sure that the following materials are developed to support someone in an interim capacity (these could be in a binder):

- A sheet with all necessary emergency info such as computer passwords, contact info; and
- A list of job activities taken from the ED job description, put into a binder.

Dr. Thompson moved, and Dr. Gregory seconded, the following motion:

To adopt the policy with these additions.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Review of the previous day's evaluator training workshop

All agreed that the workshop was worthwhile and was tightly run. There were a number of suggestions:

- Archive the presentation and send to participants.
- It would be helpful to include more exercises, more scenarios, cases/outcomes. Include examples in presentations.
- When a new evaluator is on a team, provide the person with a mentor and reduce the report writing responsibilities for a new evaluator.
- Invite newly trained evaluators to observe an evaluation visit or to be on a visit without the normal amount of responsibilities; perhaps CNME should fund this or share the expense with the school.
- Thank participants for coming.
- Training for the team leaders would be useful too; perhaps the CNME ED or an experienced team chair could provide an orientation. Always provide the previous team report on an ND program to an evaluation team for an upcoming visit to the same program. More guidance for new people is important. Perhaps every new CNME board member should be assigned a mentor, as well as every new site visitor—and mentors should be encouraged to reaches out.

Conflict of Interest Form

Board members filled out and signed the conflict of interest forms.

CLOSED SESSION

Dr. Woolard stated that the public portion of the meeting would now conclude, and the board entered into closed session to address accreditation decision-related matters and nominations matters.

Business related to recognition actions

Hearing on reaccreditation of Bastyr University's ND program

Dr. Woolard reviewed the conflict of interest policy with the board and asked members with a conflict of interest to recuse themselves. Drs. Jenab, Olehausen and Wallace recused themselves due to a conflict of interest.

Dr. Woolard next asked CNME board members to introduce themselves, and welcomed the representatives from Bastyr University:

- Dr. Arianna Staruch, Dean of Naturopathic Medicine
- Dr. David Rule, Provost and Executive V.P.
- Mr. Harlan Patterson, President

Dr. Gregory next gave an overview of the evaluation visit.

Dr. Woolard next invited the representatives from Bastyr U. to express any comments, observations and/or questions they wished about the visit and the team findings. After that, board members asked questions regarding the team's findings. Following the conversation with Bastyr's representatives, Dr. Woolard asked them to leave and the CNME board went into closed session to deliberate on the

decision regarding re-accreditation of the university's ND program.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, moved, and Dr. Stretch seconded, the following motion:

- 1. To adopt the commendations, recommendations and areas of interest set forth in the June 2019 CNME Evaluation Team Report.**
- 2. To reaffirm the accreditation of Bastyr University's ND program for a period of five years, effective October 20, 2019, with the next reaccreditation visit to be conducted in spring/summer of 2024, with a reaccreditation hearing to be held in fall of 2024; and**
- 3. To require by July 31, 2021, submission of a focused report on the program's progress in addressing the Council's outstanding recommendations, with a follow-up focused visit to both campuses during the fall of 2021.**

The motion was approved. The commendations, recommendations and areas of interest referenced in the above decision are attached as an addendum to these minutes.

Review of BINM focused report and hearing on reaccreditation of BINM's ND program

Dr. Woolard asked members with a conflict of interest to recuse themselves. Dr. Jenab recused himself. BINM Provost, Dr. Beasleigh, recused herself from discussion and decision-making, and stated that she would appear before the board as a representative of BINM.

Dr. Woolard next asked CNME board members to introduce themselves, and welcomed Michael Schanz, MBA, President of the Boucher Institute of Natural Medicine, and Dr. Beasleigh in her role as a representative of BINM.

Dr. Woolard next invited the representatives from BINM to express any comments, observations and/or questions they wished about the 2017 visit and the team findings, and the focused report. After that, board members asked questions. Following the conversation with BINM's representatives, Dr. Woolard asked them to leave and the CNME board went into closed session to discuss the focused report and deliberate on the decision regarding re-accreditation of BINM's ND program.

Dr. Olehausen moved, and Mr. Pecchia, CPA, seconded, the following motion:

- 1. To reaccredit BINM's ND program for a period of five years, retroactive to spring of 2018;**
- 2. To adopt the commendations from the 2018 evaluation team report;**
- 3. To maintain in effect the recommendations and areas of interest set forth in the CNME letter of July 7, 2019; and**
- 4. To request that the institution provide the following along with BINM's 2019 annual report:**
 - **A copy of its current lease; and**
 - **An updated financial plan with reasonable, realistic assumptions.**

The motion was approved. The commendations, recommendations and areas of interest referenced in the above decision are attached as an addendum to these minutes.

Review of CCNM focused report

Dr. Woolard asked members with a conflict of interest to recuse themselves. No members had a conflict of interest.

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, noted that the 5-year plan presented by CCNM was thorough and informative, and indicated that the institution has a viable plan for improving its financial reserves. No action was taken;

CCNM should, in its 2019 annual report, address the one outstanding recommendation.

Nominations Committee Business

Dr. Gregory stated the first order of business was to interview Dr. Cynthia Hope, Bastyr University's nominee for the institutional member representative position, and to vote on her appointment. After the Board interviewed Dr. Hope, she left the meeting room.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, moved, and Dr. Woolard seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Dr. Hope to serve as an institutional member representative position, with her term starting as of the end of this meeting.

The motion was approved.

Next, Dr. Gregory informed the board that Dr. Stretch's first term was up and that she was eligible for reappointment. Dr. Stretch indicated that she would be interested in a second term if the board is in support. Dr. Stretch left the meeting room.

Dr. Woolard moved, and Dr. Thompson seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Dr. Stretch to serve a second term a profession member.

The motion was approved.

Dr. Gregory next informed the board that they needed to appoint the following officers: President, Vice President, Treasurer, Secretary, and that the nominations committee was suggesting the following slate:

- Dr. Wallace for President
- Dr. Olehausen for V.P.
- Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, for Treasurer
- Dr. Stretch for Secretary.

Each of the above individuals stated that they were willing to serve. There were no nominations from the floor. Each individual took turns leaving the meeting room so that the board could discuss his/her candidacy and vote.

Dr. Woolard moved, and Dr. Thompson seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Dr. Wallace to serve as CNME Board President.

The motion was approved.

Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, moved, and Dr. Thompson seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Dr. Olehausen to serve as CNME Board Vice President.

The motion was approved.

Dr. Wallace moved, and Dr. Woolard seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Mr. Andrew, JD, MA, to serve as CNME Board Treasurer.

The motion was approved.

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, moved, and Dr. Olehausen seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Dr. Stretch to serve as CNME Board Secretary.

The motion was approved.

Dr. Woolard welcomed the new officers to their positions and thanked them for their willingness to serve. The board thanked Dr. Woolard for her dedicated and able service as Board President for two terms.

Dr. Gregory asked for board members' informal feedback on considering Dr. Susan Tebb, who attended the evaluator training workshop, as a potential public member. Board members who had a chance to meet her and talk with her agreed it would be worth following up on this as a possibility.

It was noted that a couple of years ago the board had considered whether it would be good to solicit two nominees for the institutional member representative position from the ND programs whose turn it was to nominate. The benefit of this to the Council is that at different times it needs people with different professional background (e.g., a faculty member vs. an academic administrator). Board members discussed the pros and cons of doing this.

Dr. Thompson moved, and Dr. Wallace seconded, the following motion:

To approve the plan to ask ND programs to provide two nominees for the institutional member representative position, and to ask Dr. Seitz to draft policy language on this to present to the board for review at its next in-person meeting.

The motion was approved.

Executive Director performance review

Dr. Seitz left the meeting so that the board could discuss Dr. Seitz's performance.

Adjournment

The board adjourned the meeting at 5:40 p.m.