

Council on Naturopathic Medical Education Board of Directors Meeting

Sunday, October 15, 2017 ♦ 8:30 a.m. – 5:00 p.m.

The Benson Hotel • Portland, Oregon

Call to order and roll call

Board president, Dr. Woolard, called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m. The following Board members were present:

- Brian Andrew, JD, MA (Public Member), Chesterfield, Missouri (attended the morning portion of the meeting);
- Hugh Bonner, PhD, FASAHP (Public Member), Rome, Georgia;
- Jasmine Carino, ND (Profession Member), Toronto, Ontario (board secretary);
- Margot Gregory, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona;
- Melanie Henriksen, ND (Institutional Member Rep., NUNM), Portland, Oregon (attended the afternoon portion of the meeting);
- Thomas Kruzel, ND (Profession Member), Scottsdale, Arizona (board vice president);
- John Pecchia, CPA (Public Member), Poughkeepsie, New York (board treasurer);
- Leslie Solomonian, ND (Institutional Member Rep., CCNM), Toronto, Ontario;
- Eileen Stretch, ND (Profession Member), Tucson, Arizona;
- H. Garrett Thompson, DC, PhD (Institutional Member Rep., SCNM), Tempe, Arizona;
- Christina Woolard, ND (Profession Member), Murfreesboro, Tennessee (board president).

Members absent:

- Jamey Wallace, ND

Staff present:

- Daniel Seitz, JD, EdD (Executive Director), Great Barrington, Massachusetts

Guests present for MUIH hearing:

- Elizabeth Pimentel, ND, Dean, MUIH School of Naturopathic Medicine
- Abigail Aiyepola, N.D., LM, Professor and Associate Dean, School of Naturopathic Medicine

Additions or other changes to the agenda

Dr. Woolard stated that the meeting would include a closed board session to review the executive director's contract, which expires December 31, 2017.

Officers' and Executive Director's reports:

Secretary's Report

Dr. Carino asked for a motion to approve the minutes of semi-annual Board meeting held on May 13, 2017.

Mr. Andrew, JD, moved, and Dr. Solomonian seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the May 13, 2017 Board of Directors meeting, with a typo corrected.

The motion was unanimously approved, with Hugh abstaining since they had not attended the last Council meeting.

President's Report

Dr. Woolard noted that since the last CNME board meeting, the executive committee had met to consider a request from the U. of Bridgeport to postpone submission of their self-study report for six months due to the dean's serious illness; the EC approved the request. She also noted that Drs. Kruzel and Henriksen were rotating off the CNME board upon completion of this meeting, and that we will be honoring them at this evening's board dinner. Finally, Dr. Woolard mentioned that she will be serving on the evaluation team that is visiting BINM in February 2018.

Vice President's Report

Dr. Kruzel had nothing to report.

Treasurer's Report

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, presented FY 2016 year-end finance report, noting that income and expenses tracked the budget fairly closely, we had a small surplus, and we continue to have a healthy financial reserve. Next, he reviewed the 09-30-17 actual-to-budget financial report and noted that we're likely to end the current fiscal year with a small surplus.

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, next presented the draft FY 2018 budget, noting that:

- The budget keeps the annual fees charged to programs the same as last year; and
- The budget projects a small surplus.

He stated that we have now gone a number of years without any fee increases, and will probably need to increase fees for FY 2019

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, moved, and Dr. Kruzel seconded, the following motion:

To approve the draft FY 2018 budget.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Executive Director's Report

Dr. Seitz reported on the following:

- The post-hurricane situation in Puerto Rico has been very difficult for the Universidad del Turabo, which is located in an area that experienced serious flooding; classes have been cancelled for the time being.
- He will be attending the fall meeting of the Canadian Naturopathic Coordinating Council (CNCC) in a couple weeks; one of the agenda items is a discussion of the Ontario ND licensing board (namely CONO, the College of Naturopaths of Ontario) to develop its own licensing exam. This decision has generated a lot of questions and concerns.
- The CNME will be conducting a reaccreditation visit to BINM at the end of February 2018.

- The U. of Bridgeport visit has been postponed to September 2018.

Committee reports and action on committee recommendations:

Executive Committee

Dr. Woolard, Chair, stated that the EC met to plan for this Council meeting, and also had a closed session to discuss renewing Dr. Seitz's contract; additionally, as noted before, the EC approved the request to postpone the U. of Bridgeport reaccreditation visit.

Finance Committee

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, Chair, stated that the committee did not need to meet since the last board meeting.

Nominations Committee

Dr. Carino, Chair, noted the following:

- Dr. Henriksen's institutional member term is ending; BINM, whose turn it is to nominate someone, has nominated Dr. Sarah Beasleigh, BINM's dean; her CV is included in the meeting materials.
- Dr. Kruzel's 2nd and final term is ending; the nominations committee is recommending that the board consider Dr. Arvin Jenab; his CV is included in the meeting materials.
- We will hold officer elections at this meeting (this is done at the annual/fall meeting in odd-numbered years).

The above matters will be addressed during the closed session later in the meeting.

In response to a question on how the CNME identifies potential board members, Dr. Carino stated that this happens in several ways: sometimes board members suggest individuals, sometimes individuals express interest in serving, and sometimes the CNME reaches out to organizations such as AANP, CAND and AANMC. Dr. Seitz stated that ASPA (Association of Specialized and Professional Accreditors) is a source of potential board members for the public member slot.

Committee on Postdoctoral Naturopathic Medical Education

Dr. Henriksen, Chair, stated that the CPNME has not needed to meet since the meeting last May; however, we need to approve the minutes from that meeting.

Dr. Kruzel moved, and Dr. Thompson seconded, the following motion:

To approve the minutes of the May 13, 2017 CPNME meeting.

The motion was unanimously approved; Dr. Bonner, who had not attended the meeting, abstained.

Committee on Standards, Policies and Procedures

Dr. Kruzel, Chair, stated that COSPP had not needed to meet since last board meeting, and that the board will be considering one procedural matter later in the meeting.

Audit Committee

Dr. Kruzel, Chair, asked Mr. Pecchia, CPA, to present the FY 2016 audited financial statement. Mr. Pecchia stated that the CNME financial statement is uncomplicated, since our financial operations are uncomplicated. The financial statement shows that there was an increase in net assets, nearly all of which is in cash. The auditors indicated that the petty cash should be under CNME's name, not the administrative assistant's name. The board asked Dr. Seitz to take care of this. The board also asked the Audit Committee to discuss whether CNME should continue with our current auditor the next time we do a review or audit.

Dr. Kruzel moved, and Dr. Thompson seconded, the following motion:

To accept the FY 2016 audit.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Strategic Planning Committee

Dr. Woolard, Chair, stated that work on the current strategic plan was completed during yesterday's meeting and that Dr. Seitz will make the final changes discussed yesterday.

Reports from other naturopathic organizations

Dr. Thompson, who serves on the Council of Chief Academic and Clinical Officers (CCACO), stated that CCACO is currently developing faculty training programs to support faculty in developing teaching skills, including skills needed to better how to engage the so-called millennials. Faculty are involved with this project

Pediatrics

Dr. Solomonian stated that the Pediatric Association of Naturopathic Physicians (PedANP), an affiliate of the American Association of Naturopathic Physicians (AANP), has begun an initiative to involve student groups.

Procedure for distributing CNME decision letters

Dr. Seitz introduced this agenda item by stating that the CNME does not have a published procedure regarding which individuals/positions within an institution should be routinely sent CNME decision letters (e.g., reaccreditation decisions). Questions include whether our procedure should be different for multipurpose vs. single-purpose institutions, or different depending on the type of decision the board issues.

The board agreed that the following individuals should receive these communications:

- The program dean (or equivalent title) and administrative staff members above the dean (e.g., provost, president, VP for academic affairs);
- The chair of the board of directors; and
- External regulatory agencies (e.g., regional accreditation agency, state/provincial board of higher education)

When the CNME accreditation handbook is updated to reflect this new procedure, it should also be communicated to the schools.

The board entered into closed session to address business related to recognition actions and other matters.

Review of MUIH's eligibility application for the ND Program

Prior to the hearing with MUIH representatives, Dr. Seitz reviewed the eligibility application process; the following MUIH representative were then invited to be present:

- Elizabeth Pimentel, ND, Dean, MUIH School of Naturopathic Medicine
- Abigail Aiyepola, N.D., LM, Professor and Associate Dean, School of Naturopathic Medicine

Dr. Pimentel provided information on the program, noting that:

- MUIH has been contemplating developing an ND program for some time; when ND licensure was approved in Maryland, MUIH fast-tracked this plan;
- The program is scheduled to launch in fall 2018;
- They will use a cohort model with one entrance per year; right now, they are planning on up to 40 students per year;
- Dr. Aiyepola and she are full-time at MUIH;
- They are still in the process of developing the program and course curricula;
- In addition to the usual didactic and clinical components, MUIH will also include a strong focus on personal development;
- They will utilize blended/hybrid delivery for a number of classes, as well as the concept of "flipped classrooms";
- There may be some shared classes with other programs, but probably not a lot since there is a question of both the rigor and focus of shared classes.

The board posed a number of questions regarding: the financial stability of the institution and ability to support a new program; the board's commitment to the ND program; situation with a new president who only just recently came on board; the narrow ND scope of practice in Maryland; plans for bringing in new faculty and the balance of part-time and full-time faculty; and other matters.

Following the conversation with the program representatives, the program representatives left the meeting room and the board continued in closed session. Prior to reviewing and voting on the eligibility application, Dr. Woolard asked if any CNME members present had a conflict of interest requiring recusal; no members had a conflict of interest. Dr. Woolard also reminded board members of the confidential nature of the information they have received.

Dr. Kruzel moved, and Mr. Pecchia, CPA, seconded, the following motion:

- 1. Defer a decision on the application for 6 months to 1 year, pending receipt of the following:**
 - a. A more realistic, detailed and in-depth financial pro forma for the ND program (among other things, the pro forma should include more realistic enrollment and financial projections);**
 - b. A copy of MUIH's FY 2017 audited financial statement and copies of the previous four years of audited financials;**
 - c. A realistic plan that outlines how MUIH plans to manage its outstanding deficit and ultimately bring its deficit to a manageable level;**
 - d. An update on MUIH's progress in building the naturopathic clinic practice;**
 - e. An update on course content development for the ND program, especially for years**

- one and two of the program;
 - f. An update on MUIH's efforts to identify and hire qualified faculty for the ND program.
 - g. An update on enrollment in the ND program; and
 - h. A general update on any aspects of the eligibility application that may have changed since the original application was submitted.
2. To leave to MUIH's discretion Whether to resubmit the updated eligibility application with the above information in time for the spring 2018 meeting or the fall 2018 meeting, with the requirement that the updated application be submitted at least one month prior to meeting.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Review of BINM's FY 2017 year-end financials

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, provided the following feedback on BINM's financial statements: The financials show improvement in financial performance over the last few years in all areas. The institution has not yet, however, achieved solid financial stability—they still have a large debt to pay off, but they seem to be managing it better. We will need to continue to monitor this situation. There continues to be some question about how realistic Boucher's 5-year financial projection/forecast is.

Dr. Seitz reiterated that the CNME would be conducting a comprehensive site visit for reaccreditation

Dr. Seitz will inform Boucher that the board did not remove any of the outstanding recommendations or areas of interest, but that they agreed that the institution is moving in the right direction.

Review of UT focused report on re-staffing

Dr. Thompson and Carino provided the following feedback on the report provided by U. del Turabo on the staffing of their ND program: The steps that UT has taken to address staffing issues appear to be satisfactory.

The board accepted the report and would like for UT to provide any follow-up information as part of the 2017 annual report.

Board appointments

Dr. Carino informed the board that the nominations committee had met with Arvin Jenab, ND, and is recommending that the board consider him for appointment as a profession member to fill the vacancy that will result when Dr. Kruzel's term ends at this end of this meeting. The board then interviewed Dr. Jenab via conference call.

Mr. Andrew, JD, moved, and Dr. Solomonian seconded, the following motion:

To appoint Arvin Jenab, ND, to a profession member seat on the CNME board of directors, with his term to start upon completion of this meeting.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Officer Elections

Dr. Seitz stated that the board bylaws require election of officers every two years, and that elections take place during the annual (fall) meeting in odd years. Current officers who were not leaving the board

indicated whether they were interested in continuing to serve in an officer role, and other board members not currently serving as an officer indicated whether they would be interested in being considered for appointment.

Dr. Woolard stated that she would be willing to continue to serve as board president. No other board members expressed interest in being considered. Dr. Woolard left the meeting room and the board had an opportunity to discuss her continued service in this position.

Dr. Kruzel, as VP, asked the board to vote via secret ballot on reappointing Dr. Woolard as president with the following result: **Dr. Woolard was reappointed as president.**

Mr. Pecchia, CPA, stated that he would be willing to continue to serve as board treasurer. No other board members expressed interest in being considered. Mr. Pecchia, CPA, left the meeting room and the board had an opportunity to discuss his continued service in this position.

Dr. Woolard asked the board to vote via secret ballot on reappointing Mr. Pecchia, CPA, as treasurer with the following result: **Mr. Pecchia, CPA was reappointed as treasurer.**

Two board members expressed interest in being considered for the board secretary position, both of whom left the meeting room to give the board an opportunity to discuss their candidacy. Dr. Woolard asked the board to vote via secret ballot on the candidates with the following result: **Dr. Thompson was appointed as secretary by majority vote.**

Two board members expressed interest in being considered for the board vice president position, both of whom left the meeting room to give the board an opportunity to discuss their candidacy. Dr. Woolard asked the board to vote via secret ballot on the candidates with the following result: **Dr. Gregory was appointed as vice president by majority vote.**

Miscellaneous business (open session)

Date and site for next meeting

The next Council meeting will take place on Saturday and Sunday, May 26 and 27, 2018; we are looking into holding the meeting in Toronto or Montreal.

Recognition of departing members

Dr. Woolard stated the Drs. Kruzel and Henriksen are leaving the board and thanked them for their tremendous contributions. They will be honored at the board dinner.

The meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.